

**SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**  
**Tuesday, 4 December 2018 at 7.30 pm**  
**Council Chamber - Civic Centre**

1. Apologies for Absence and Substitutions
2. Declarations of Interest  

To receive Councillors' declarations of interest (if any) in relation to any matters on the agenda.
3. Minutes (Pages 2 - 5)  

To approve the minutes of the meeting held on 16 October 2018.
4. Matters arising
5. Written questions from members of the public  

To receive any questions from members of the public in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 10.
6. Written questions from Councillors  

To receive any questions from Councillors in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 11.
7. Responses of the Cabinet to Reports of the Scrutiny Committee  

To consider responses (if any) of the Cabinet to reports and recommendations from the Committee.
8. Review of the Provision of Health Care Services and Adult Social Care in the Town - Presentations from West Essex CCG and Essex County Council
9. Review of Paddling Pools - Scoping Report (Pages 6 - 7)
10. Work Plan (Page 8)  

To review the Committee's work plan for the current year.
11. References from Other Committees
12. Matters of Urgent Business  

Such other business which, in the opinion of the Chair, should be received as a matter of urgency by reason of special circumstances to be specified in the minutes.

**MINUTES OF THE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE  
HELD ON**

16 October 2018

7.30 - 9.00 pm

**PRESENT**

**Committee Members**

Councillor Bob Davis (Chair)  
Councillor Simon Carter  
Councillor Joel Charles  
Councillor Maggie Hulcoop  
Councillor Edna Stevens  
Councillor Chris Vince

**Officers**

Simon Freeman, Head of Finance and Deputy to the Managing Director  
Jane Greer, Head of Community Wellbeing  
Adam Rees, Governance Support Officer

**Also Present**

Jean Chivral, Osler House Action Group  
Colin Thorpe, Osler House Action Group  
Ian Tomkins, West Essex CCG  
Kevin Tucker, Osler House Action Group  
Peter Whiteman, West Essex CCG

25. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors David Carter, Tony Edwards, Shona Johnson and Stefan Mullard.

26. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor Maggie Hulcoop declared a non-pecuniary interest in Item 10, Review of the Closure of Osler House – Interview with Osler House Action Group, as a Ward Councillor for Harlow Common.

Councillor Joel Charles also declared a non-pecuniary interest in Item 10 as a director of a health and social care policy charity.

27. **MINUTES**

**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting held on 9 September 2018 are agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

28. **MATTERS ARISING**

The Chair said that Item 10 would be considered as the first substantive item at the meeting.

29. **WRITTEN QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC**

None.

30. **WRITTEN QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS**

None.

31. **RESPONSES OF THE CABINET TO REPORTS OF THE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**RESOLVED** that the following responses of the Cabinet to reports of the Scrutiny Committee were noted.

- a) Response of the Cabinet to the Review of Civic Pride and Education
- b) Responses of the Cabinet to the Review of Universal Credit in Harlow

32. **REVIEW OF THE CLOSURE OF OSLER HOUSE - INTERVIEW WITH OSLER HOUSE ACTION GROUP**

The Chair invited the West Essex CCG to give a brief presentation. Peter Whiteman gave a high level overview of pressures on services, both nationally and locally. He then explained that the health care provider for Osler House had said they were no longer able to provide a service. There were no viable options and as a result a consultation did not take place on the closure. It had been noted that patients had received letters notifying them of the closure, two days before the Council and Councillors had been notified. This was an error for which the CCG had apologised for.

The Chair then invited members of the Osler House Action Group to speak. Jean Chivral spoke about the distance to other surgeries throughout Harlow to Osler House. Although the distance to Church Langley's surgery was 0.9 miles, this assumed the patient had the ability to drive. For those that couldn't, two buses were required and the total distance was seven miles. This was a factor in deterring the elderly from visiting their GP. She hoped that an open day for affected residents would be organised.

Colin Thorpe then spoke about the viability of Osler House. In 2017, the CCG had said it was viable. It was also unclear how it was possible to pay the other surgeries in Harlow a premium for taking patients dispersed from Osler House, when Osler House itself was no longer supposed to be viable. He then noted that other, smaller, surgeries in west Essex had

been put out for tender. He asked why this had not happened for Osler House.

Kevin Tucker explained that legislation surrounding surgeries required consultation to take place with both residents and key stakeholders. This had not happened with Osler House.

Councillor Hulcoop that Osler House had been threatened by closure twice before and both times there had been a dialogue with the CCG. She was disappointed that this time there had been no time to discuss a potential solution.

In response to a number of questions by Councillor Charles, Peter Whiteman explained that the same process had been followed for the closure of other surgeries in west Essex. Whilst the demographic in Harlow Common was older than average, Osler House's patient list was younger than average.

He explained that there were a number of pressures surrounding health care provision in Harlow. These included attracting staff due to Harlow's proximity to London. There was a need for larger teams and surgeries were being encouraged to work co-operatively to ensure the best service was achieved.

Ian Tomkins said that the CCG was looking to improve the way it communicated in order to build shared solutions, as well as involving more people in the decision making process.

The Chair said that a report would be presented to Cabinet on the findings of the review.

33. **IMPROVING THE PROVISION OF BUS SERVICES IN HARLOW - INTERIM REPORT**

The Committee received an interim report on improving the provision of bus services in Harlow. The report set of a possible programme of improvements that Officers were working with bus operators and the County Council to develop. This would be presented to the Committee with the final report.

The Committee agreed that the review's scope should be widened to look at the reliability of bus services.

**RESOLVED** that:

- A** The Committee noted the progress of the review so far.
- B** The scope of the review be widened to include the reliability of bus services.

34. **REVIEW OF THE IMPACT OF PERMITTED DEVELOPMENT - INTERIM REPORT**

The Committee received an interim report on the review of the impact of permitted development, which set of the evidence gathered, work undertaken, and a potential work programme.

**RESOLVED** that the Committee notes the contents of the report and the work due to be undertaken.

35. **WORK PLAN**

The Committee received a report summarising its work plan for 2018/19.

The Committee noted that a review of paddling pools had been referred to it by Full Council and agreed to receive a scoping report at its next meeting.

It was also agreed that due to work pressure placed on Community Wellbeing by the paddling pools review that the Review of the Provision of Health Care Services and Adult Social Care in the Town would now only consist of presentations. Additionally, the final report for the Review of Policing in the Town would now be considered at the first meeting of the 2019/20 municipal year

**RESOLVED** that:

- A** The work plan be noted.
- B** A scoping report on the Review of Paddling Pools be considered at the next meeting of the Committee.
- C** The Review of the Provision of Health Care Services and Adult Social Care in the Town only consist of presentations.
- D** The final report for the Review of Policing in the Town be considered at the first meeting of the 2019/20 municipal year.

36. **REFERENCES FROM OTHER COMMITTEES**

None.

37. **MATTERS OF URGENT BUSINESS**

None.

CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE

**REPORT TO:** SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

**DATE:** 4 DECEMBER 2018

**TITLE:** REVIEW OF PADDLING POOLS – SCOPING REPORT

**LEAD OFFICER:** JANE GREER, HEAD OF COMMUNITY WELLBEING (01279) 446406

**CONTRIBUTING OFFICER:** MARYSIA RUDGLEY, COMMUNITY SAFETY TEAM MANANGER (01279) 446115

<b>Review Topic</b>	Review of Paddling Pools
<b>Links to the Council's priorities</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regeneration and a thriving economy</li> <li>• Wellbeing and Social Inclusion</li> <li>• Successful Children and Young People</li> </ul>
<b>Terms of reference (to include the scope of the review)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To explore options on the existing five paddling pools and one Splash Park in Harlow.</li> </ul>
<b>Purpose and objective of the review (what the review should achieve)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To gain an understanding of the operation of the five existing paddling pools and one splash park.</li> <li>• To gain an understanding of any Health and Safety implications.</li> <li>• To gain an understanding of costs associated with improvements or the replacement of the five existing paddling pools and one splash park.</li> <li>• If appropriate, to make recommendations to the Cabinet and the Council for changes and improvements to the existing five paddling pools and one splash park to enhance experience for users of the pools and reduce risk.</li> </ul>
<b>Methodology/approach (methods to be used for gathering evidence)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Desktop research</li> <li>• Analytical information</li> <li>• Interviews</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentations and reports</li> </ul>
<b>Written evidence required</b>	<p>Analysis of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost associated with enhancing experience for users of the pools and splash park and reducing risk at the Paddling pools and Splash Park</li> <li>• Health and Safety Implications</li> </ul>
<b>Potential witnesses</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Head of Community Wellbeing</li> <li>• Community Safety Team Manager</li> <li>• Representatives from Harlow Trading Services (HTS)</li> <li>• Senior Building Surveyor</li> <li>• Local schools and local schoolchildren</li> <li>• Harlow Youth Council</li> </ul>
<b>Potential Stakeholder involvement (who are the stakeholders and how will their views be sought)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Harlow Council and Harlow Trading Services are the key stakeholders</li> </ul>
<b>Publicity (methods to be used)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Council Website</li> </ul>
<b>Resources (people, expenditure)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Officer time</li> </ul>
<b>Barriers/dangers/risks (any weaknesses or potential pitfalls in the review)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Capacity of officers to support the review</li> <li>• Willingness of the Community in Harlow to support the review</li> </ul>
<b>Measures of success (how will the success of the review be measured)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recommendations made by the Committee, and adopted by relevant body, aiming to enhance experience and reduce risk at the existing five Paddling Pools and one Splash Park.</li> </ul>

## Scrutiny Committee Work Plan 2018/19

Title	Tuesday 24 July 2018	Tuesday 4 September 2018	Tuesday 16 October 2018	Tuesday 4 December 2018	Tuesday 5 February 2019	Tuesday 19 March 2019
Civic Pride and Education	Final report					
Improving the Provision of Bus Services in Harlow			Interim report			Final report
Review of Universal Credit in Harlow		Update report				
Review of the Impact of Permitted Development		Scoping report	Interim report		Final report	
Review of the Closure of Osler House			Interview with Osler House Action Group			
Parking in the Town					Scoping report	
Review of the Provision of Health Care Services and Adult Social Care in the Town				Presentations from West Essex CCG and Essex County Council		
Review of Policing in the Town		Scoping report				
Review of Paddling Pools				Scoping Report		
Transport Links in and out of Harlow <i>Delayed pending the completion of the preparation of the Local Plan including transportation evidence and input by Essex County Council</i>						
Review of Educational Provision						
Review of Youth Club Provision						