

**MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL
HELD ON**

20 September 2018

7.30 - 8.45 pm

PRESENT

COUNCILLORS

Maggie Hulcoop (Chair)
Clive Souter (Vice-Chair)

Simon Carter	Eddie Johnson
Nick Churchill	Shona Johnson
Jean Clark	Sue Livings
Mike Danvers	Stefan Mullard
Bob Davis	Russell Perrin
Tony Durcan	Danny Purton
Waida Forman	Lanie Shears
Michael Garnett	Edna Stevens
Tony Hall	Emma Toal
Michael Hardware	Chris Vince
Eugenie Harvey	Phil Waite
Mark Ingall	Mark Wilkinson
Andrew Johnson	

OFFICERS

Brian Keane, Managing
Director
Janet Jackson, Corporate and
Governance Support Team
Leader
Colleen O'Boyle, Interim Head
of Governance
Lisa Thornett, Corporate
Governance Support Officer

29. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors David Carter, Joel Charles, Karen Clempner, Tony Edwards and John Strachan.

30. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

None.

31. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 12 July 2018 are agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

32. **COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CHAIR**

The Chair outlined various events she had attended and in particular drew attention to the Carnival and the Golf day where she had raised in excess of £1600 from both events for her chosen charities.

The Chair reminded Councillors that she would appreciate their support at the Civic Service to be held on 30 September 2018.

33. **PETITIONS FROM THE PUBLIC**

a) Save Harlow Town Park Paddling Pool

A petition of 1549 signatures was received to save Harlow Town Paddling Pool.

Mr Dear presented his petition to the Council and Councillors then debated the petition.

Proposed by Councillor Andrew Johnson (seconded by Councillor Mark Ingall) it was:

RESOLVED that the original proposal to renovate all five paddling pools to splash parks be rescinded and the item be referred to the Scrutiny Committee for consideration.

34. **QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC**

The questions together with the answers are appended to the minutes.

35. **QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS**

The questions together with the answers are appended to the minutes.

36. **MOTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS**

None.

37. **REFERENCES FROM CABINET AND COMMITTEES**

a) Referral from Cabinet - Local Development Plan - Submission to Planning Inspectorate for Examination Under Regulation 22

Proposed by Councillor Danny Purton (seconded by Councillor Mark Ingall) it was:

RESOLVED that:

A The Harlow Local Development Plan Pre-Submission Publication (2018) be formally approved for Submission to the Secretary of State in accordance with Regulation 22 of the Town and Country Planning (Local Development) (England) Regulations 2012 (as amended).

B The updated Local Development Scheme (Appendix G to the report) be approved.

C Delegated authority be given to the Managing Director, in consultation with the Leader of the Council and the Portfolio

Holder for Environment, to make and approve any minor and inconsequential amendments to the documents to be submitted in support of the Harlow Local Development Plan Pre-Submission Publication (2018) arising from the completion of the ensuing technical studies prior to the Public Examination.

A vote on the motion was recorded. The details of the recorded named vote are below.

Referral from Cabinet - Local Development Plan - Submission to Planning Inspectorate for Examination Under Regulation 22 (Resolution)	
Councillor Maggie Hulcoop	For
Councillor Clive Souter	Abstain
Councillor Simon Carter	Against
Councillor Nick Churchill	Against
Councillor Jean Clark	For
Councillor Mike Danvers	For
Councillor Bob Davis	For
Councillor Tony Durcan	For
Councillor Waida Forman	For
Councillor Michael Garnett	Against
Councillor Tony Hall	Against
Councillor Michael Hardware	Against
Councillor Eugenie Harvey	For
Councillor Mark Ingall	For
Councillor Andrew Johnson	Against
Councillor Eddie Johnson	Against
Councillor Shona Johnson	Against
Councillor Sue Livings	Against
Councillor Stefan Mullard	For
Councillor Russell Perrin	Against
Councillor Danny Purton	For
Councillor Lanie Shears	For
Councillor Edna Stevens	For
Councillor Emma Toal	For
Councillor Chris Vince	For
Councillor Phil Waite	For
Councillor Mark Wilkinson	For
Carried	

b) Referral from Cabinet - Annual Treasury Management Report 2017/18

Proposed by Councillor Mike Danvers (seconded by Councillor Mark Ingall)
it was:

RESOLVED that:

A The Annual Treasury Management Report for 2017/18, including that the Council operated within the Treasury Management Strategy Statement during 2017/18, be noted and approved.

B The issues that the outcome of the EU Referendum is creating and their impact on the Council's treasury management activities be noted.

- c) Referral from Licensing Committee - Use of Roof Signs on Private Hire Vehicles

Proposed by Councillor Edna Stevens (seconded by Councillor Lanie Shears) it was

RESOLVED that:

A Private Hire Vehicle Licensing Conditions be amended to require private hire vehicles to display roof signs; and

B The specification for roof signs displayed by licensed private hire vehicles, be delegated to the Environment and Licensing Manager in consultation with the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Licensing Committee.

38. **REPORTS FROM OFFICERS**

None.

39. **MINUTES OF CABINET AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the following meetings are noted.

- a) Minutes of meeting Wednesday, 4 July 2018 of Development Management Committee
- b) Minutes of meeting Tuesday, 10 July 2018 of Licensing Committee
- c) Minutes of meeting Thursday, 19 July 2018 of Cabinet
- d) Minutes of meeting Tuesday, 24 July 2018 of Scrutiny Committee
- e) Minutes of meeting Tuesday, 31 July 2018 of Audit and Standards Committee
- f) Minutes of meeting Wednesday, 22 August 2018 of Development Management Committee
- g) Minutes of meeting Tuesday, 4 September 2018 of Scrutiny Committee

h) Minutes of meeting Wednesday, 5 September 2018 of Special Audit and Standards Committee

40. **MATTERS OF URGENT BUSINESS**

None.

CHAIR OF THE COUNCIL

Agenda item 6 refers

1. Mr David Forman to Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

- a) Will Harlow District Council adopt the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance Working Definition of Antisemitism and its accompanying 11 examples of contemporary antisemitism in society without addition or deletion, especially given the fact that the United Kingdom government adopted it in December 2016, in order to build further confidence within the Jewish community in Harlow that antisemitism will not be tolerated?

- b) If the desire to be free to criticise the actions of the Israeli government unencumbered by allegations of antisemitism delays your adoption of the HRA definition in full, will the Labour administration accept the explanation offered by the experts of the UK delegation to the IHRA Working Definition of Antisemitism issued in a press release on 7 August 2018: *“Any ‘modified’ version of the IHRA definition that does not include all of its 11 examples is no longer the IHRA Definition. Adding or removing language undermines the months of international diplomacy and academic rigour that enabled this definition to exist. If one organisation or institution can amend the wording to suit its own need, then logically anyone else could do the same. We would once again revert to a world where antisemitism goes unaddressed simply because different entities cannot agree on what it is”*?

Response from Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

There have been some concerns amongst some people interested in international affairs that accepting the IHRA definition of anti-Semitism, together with the 11 examples, would prevent them from ever criticising the actions of the Israeli State, without being themselves labelled as being anti-Semitic. Hence, they have been worried about accepting it without deletions or additions.

However proper reading of the text shows these fears are unfounded. The IHRA definition explicitly accepts that criticism of actions taken by the State of Israel can be made; as long as those criticisms are not used as a vehicle to deny the right of the State of Israel to exist, as long as those criticisms are of the actions of the state and not of the Jewish religion, as long as the State of Israel is not singled out for criticism and as long as comparisons are not made with the Holocaust.

Thus I feel confident that I could, if I wanted, speak out about the treatment of Palestinians by the State of Israel, just as I could, if I wanted, speak out about

the actions of the Saudi Arabian regime in Yemen, the appalling human tragedy unfolding for the Rohingya people in Myanmar and countless other examples of Governments acting in ways that are unacceptable. All very different issues, but all deeply troubling to people interested in international affairs.

Given this freedom, as the definition allows, I am happy to align myself fully with the IHRA definition and, via a motion that we will present to Council at the earliest opportunity, we will incorporate the definition into any relevant Council procedures.

But, I want to go further than that. Countering anti-Semitism and racism in all its forms is an issue I am certain members from both sides of this chamber feel passionate about. Therefore I propose that the Portfolio Holder for Equality and Diversity sets up a working group, to include Councillors from the opposition and leading figures in the Jewish community, to see what other measures we can take to build confidence within the Jewish Community, that this Council as a whole, condemns anti-Semitism, will not tolerate it and will take active steps to ensure that the Jewish community feel welcome and included as a valuable and intrinsic part of this religiously and ethnically diverse town.

2. Mr John Wake to Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

Given that Harlow District Council had a budget surplus of one and a quarter million pounds for the last financial year, why has the Council not revised the Harlow Council Tax Support Scheme so that jobless householders in Harlow do not bear the full burden of the central government cut in funding for this benefit?

Response from Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

The Council achieved a surplus for the 2017/18 year which was one off in nature. The Council would be committing to ongoing costs if any revision to the Local Council Tax Support Scheme were made such that a lower contribution was made by claimants. It is not the Council's policy to use one off resources to meet costs of ongoing commitments and would not demonstrate good financial management to do so.

Further, although Harlow have the duty to collect Council tax, the component kept by Harlow is just under 16 pence in every pound. Most of the money goes to Essex County Council and the Essex Police, Fire and Crime Commissioner. They will not accept a reduction in the component that they take, so for every pound Harlow reduces Council Tax for the jobless, it would cost the Council £6.37.

3. Mr Hugh Hoad to Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

At the Full Council meeting on 29 March, a motion was moved that in view of the poor state of repair of the highways of Harlow, the Essex County Council Portfolio Holder for Highways would meet with Harlow County and District Councillors, the public and other interested parties to discuss. This meeting has not taken place. Was there ever any intention to hold this meeting?

Response from Councillor Mark Ingall, Leader of the Council

Following the Full Council meeting on 29 March a letter was sent to the Leader of the County Council. The Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Infrastructure of the County Council, Councillor Kevin Bentley, then met with a residents' association to discuss their concerns.

I, together with a small group of Residents from the Waterhouse Moor Residents' Association, have since met with Councillor Bentley, and in August he joined me in a tour of Harlow to view some of the worst potholes within the town. Last week I received an email from the County Council stating that although the County Council prioritises main roads, rather than estate roads, permanent repairs were taking place on the following estate roads:

- a) Northbrooks – week commencing 13 September 2018
- b) Maddox Road – week commencing 17 September 2018
- c) Momples Road – week commencing 17 September 2018
- d) Church Leys – week commencing 25 September 2018

Although I'm under no illusions that there are a large number of issues outside of these four roads that need urgent attention, it is a promising start. I am thankful that Councillor Bentley came to Harlow to listen to our concerns and will continue to work with him to ensure that our town's potholes are prioritised.

Agenda item 7 refers

1. Councillor Shona Johnson to Councillor Waida Forman, Deputy Leader and Portfolio Holder for Equality and Diversity

Does the Portfolio Holder believe that the Council and all political parties making it up should recognise, sign up to and enforce the IHRA definition of Antisemitism in full?

Response from Councillor Waida Forman, Deputy Leader and Portfolio Holder for Equality and Diversity

Please see the answer given by the Leader if the Council in response to question 1 of the questions from the public. I am a hate crime ambassador and as you know this Council is a Hate Incident Reporting Centre and we will continue to campaign to raise awareness of hate crime, such as anti-Semitism and how to report such crimes. I hope that Councillor Shona Johnson will join me and become a hate crime ambassador and work with me to educate the community.

2. Councillor Shona Johnson to Councillor Waida Forman, Deputy Leader and Portfolio Holder for Equality and Diversity

As we have just celebrated Yom Kippur (18 to 19 September), can the Portfolio Holder tell us what the Council is doing to combat Antisemitism in Harlow?

Response from Councillor Waida Forman, Deputy Leader and Portfolio Holder for Equality and Diversity

Please see the answer given by the Leader if the Council in response to question 1 of the questions from the public. However, I would like to add that I have recently launched the Faith and Culture forum of which I am the Chair. I am pleased to announce that Rabbi Irit Shillor is the Vice Chair and we will work together to promote inclusion in our town. As a Muslim and a black person, I have personally experience racism and Islamophobia and I am not prepared to stand by and watch the Jewish community feel vulnerable and suffer. I have a long history of standing up to racism, fascism, anti-Semitism and Islamophobia; I will keep on doing so for anyone of any faith, belief, colour or gender. For years I, along with other Labour Councillors and Labour Party members have attended the Holocaust Memorial Service at the Synagogue and I hope to see Conservative Councillors at the next service, as this will show solidarity to the Jewish Community on a cross party basis.